

TRANSLATION OF: "Transcription of Negotiations between villagers of Dodolo and Kaduwaa concerning violation of KKM (voluntary conservation agreements) -- Transkription by Syaiful Taslim, Palu (February 2008)"

[Translator's note: In what follows, gaps in coherence are indicated in square brackets thus: [...???...]; and sense-preserving interpolations of my own are put within plain brackets thus: ()]

Dodolo A-E Track 1

0.00

0.08 As I was just saying, for their information, Kaduwaa will undergo changes in the next 10 years. Apart from changes due just to the passage of time and technological developments, we also understand that we ourselves will inevitably change.

0.24 In order to change from this pattern would demand human resources.

0.31 I will not speak of the system of government over the last 32 years [...???...] The system of government has changed.

0.43 But at the very least, the people want to engage in politics [...???...]

0.46 in a positive sense, so that they might understand how the process of development works and how government operates.

0.56 Prior to this I and the deceased, and now I myself as village head, studied this and found that the system of government was too "top down" (and asked ourselves)

1.10 how the people now can develop both human and natural resources through the existing channels.

1.23 That is what I want now.

And that is why I was saying just now (that) they are strongly supported by their own resources (but) without training or accompaniment/support from various parties whether from NGOs or from the government the people do not have [...???...].

1.44 As I was saying a while ago, we will go hand in hand with the TNC.

1.54 Before they came to Indonesia we had already had discussions with the TNC --we told Mr Ismet [...???...] At that time the TNC was led by Duncan [...???...] and the YTM (Yayasan Tanah Merdeka) [...???...]

2.14 now the TNC is led by Ismet who happens to be an activist. How can we work in together? The

2.33 TNC only talks about the matter of conservation projects (and) how to stimulate the economy of the populace.

2.40 We from the YTM are in a different area and talk not only about economic matters, but (also) talk about how to strengthen public organizations

2.51 such as customary/customary-law organizations, youth organizations, village conservation organizations or whatever,

2.57 in the form of education and training. There are many forms of training -- there is training in matters of law, political training and [...???...] to do with women.

3.12 Or we from the YTM coordinate women by means of organizations which operate in the area of women's issues -- like the KPKPST in Palu which is engaged in advocacy for women's rights

3.33 on matters of gender equality

[There is approximately one minute of untranscribed audio here which includes comments from the floor]

4.30 And so if the people are in consensus and want to work in the strengthening of rights and the strengthening of organizations and we work together in this area (then) the process of working together,

4.44 for example the process of conflict resolution with regard to natural resources -- and the people indicate that they do not wish this to be facilitated by YTM (then) it can be like this. When there is (some such) process the people can observe this model (i.e. that it)

5.05 turns out that YTM truly works,

5.10 or it could be that this consensus could be changed back (to what it was) or else it might be that YTM is considered not to be working seriously (then) the relationship with YTM can be severed.

5.14 This is a political process. A political process [...??...] where the people choose but do not know what it is they are choosing.

5.29 The problem is that the people choose but do not know what they are choosing. And knowing what is being chosen, this is a problem now, choosing something that is not known about or understood. This is a recipe for disaster.

5.45 (comment from public 01)

I gave an account of the agreement/consensus that had been adopted by the people of Kaduua and ultimately it was known of and agreed to by the Regent [Translator's note: I.e. the Regent (i.e. the Bupati) of sub-provincial level of government (i.e. the Kabupaten), the level above the district, I.e. kecamatan, level] and the head of the Regional Representative Assembly.

Now I have a question for you sir (Mr Hamdin of the YTM): if the people do indeed come to an agreement with YTM

6.13 then what is the issue?

That's what I was saying -- the TNC is an international NGO -- it is different from the YTM which is a local and national NGO but which networks with international (organizations) -- a local or national NGO but is part of an international network.

6.30 We from the YTM -- all this time -- have wanted the agreement of the regional government -- or even if we didn't get that agreement we would still go ahead.

6.39 That is why I say NGOs in Indonesia, in general, do not include TNC and Care, because both of these are international NGOs.

6.50 Apart from that NGOs in Indonesia have come into being with the aim of critiquing the government

6.58 Or (because) they could see that government programs were not working.

7.06 So NGOs came into being because of the lack of success of the government in

7.07 empowering the people of Indonesia

(comment from public 02)

7.18 This means, if you will excuse me, that local NGOs educate the people in an explicit way in order to hand over to the government things that have not been successful. [Translator's note: or possibly to "attack the government over"; "attack" (menyerang) being used ungrammatically here in the form "menyerang kepada". The audio is not clear enough to decide whether it is "menyerah kepada" (I.e. "surrender/hand over to") or "menyerang kepada" (I.e. "attack" used ungrammatically)]

7.34 Roughly, that is so. But more precisely, it is to claim the rights and duties not granted by the government.

7.45 All this time the government has claimed what the duties of the people are,

7.49 but has never granted rights to the people. And the people have not known what rights had been granted or whether they had not yet been granted. The people have not known what their rights were.

8.01 In the legislation [...???....] of the nation in this matter -- one of the aims of the government has been to make the life of the people "more intelligent" (or: "more sophisticated") by means of formal education,

8.17 The question now is how come that education did not succeed in making the people more sophisticated/shrewd or why the channels of formal education were not within the reach of the people at large.

8.31 Because what is available here is only primary school and there are even those who have not completed primary school. Why is this not within the reach of the people?

8.38 It is because they are economically weak.

8.41 And, indeed, just when the economy became weak that was when educational subsidies were withdrawn.

8.48 Can you imagine! How could the government in a structural sense be almost not able to see what were in fact quite apparently the rights of their citizens.

9.08 There was/has been a transformation of the people in the People's Representative Assembly

(comment from the public 03)

9.11 On the other hand, sir, we have an obstacle in this area, so how can we make a break-through in this matter -- how can we "break through the wall" so to speak.

9.22 That is why, to be quite frank, we often have encouraged the people to take action, to demonstrate, and claim their rights. Because we are sure that

9.34 (there is an unclear and laughing comment)

9.44 One form of popular action in Dodolo has been "reclaiming" without ignoring/demeaning the matter of areas held under customary tenure.

9.50 The areas held under customary tenure we will resolve retrospectively. The important thing is that through/because of the process of "reclaiming" by the people of Dodolo there has been serious attention from the government. Otherwise the government would not have been serious.

10.04

(comment from the public 03)

For as long as here in Kaduaa village we have pointed out to KKM that we have not lost out, whereas we do feel that we have lost out. We have lost out because of the naming of the village as a customary Pekurehua area. In accordance with what you, sir, have just said, the road (the main Napu-Besoa road) in fact borders with the National Park. But I am thinking that the TNC came here in 1992 whereas the opening of the road was begun in 1984. This is rather ... how should I put it ... untoward (or, possibly: far-fetched).

10.48 So we know about this by means of research, there is complete information about this.

Previously it can be imagined ... the process of making the road (was undertaken by means of) clearing the area in the 1970s.

11.02 In Palolo, the original (I.e. local) people saw the excavator(s) because they went past their orchards.

11.11 This is the outcome of our interview with Mr Beny the head of the regional forum of discussants of Palolo. But we will talk explicitly about it soon.

11.24

(comment from the public 04)

11.28 Don't say that! [...???.] it would be fine if the YTM helped us, but in the form of [...???.] not like now.

11.37 But don't let there be any conflict with Toe about this event [...???.] such as education [...???.]

11.47 so that human resources can be developed. Don't let it be that YTM only discusses conflict, while other matters such as education and facilities [...???.], try to [...???.] If that is what was/were facilitated it would be quite OK.

12.09 The point is this: we -- I guarantee that [...???.] not only a problem in Toe [...???.] wants to go into 68 villages. Only, the financial support is still inadequate, so we only choose certain points based on the map [...???.]

12.31

(there is an unclear comment (I.e. from the floor))

12.42 We have balanced out the spread of these points -- if we had a map of the national park it would be easier to talk about it.

Why did we choose Moa, Gimpu, Mataue, Toro, Dodolo ...

13.04 At that time Wanga and Kaduaa were not included -- then later why in Doda and Katu.

13.10 It was our hope at that time that the process would be extended to neighbouring villages because the source of human resources was minimal there.

13.22 That was the outcome. If we look at Katu, Ferdinand, who was working there, ended up only managing the football match for the Independence Day celebrations.

13.34 That was the outcome. It should have been that Ferdinand had already spoken like this ...

(comment by public 04)

For example, in Katu there was the release of 1,178 ha for the exploitation of forest products.

13.53 That was what we wanted, so in Katu there was clearing (of forest/woodlands). There was a certain amount for exploitation, there was a certain amount for a residential area and there was a certain area that had to be kept for the purposes of water collection/run off.

14.08 And then there was the (question of) wildlife in the area -- (as to) which of them had to be protected.

14.14 And which of them could be used for human consumption ... Meaning they could still be hunted -- such as wild pigs -- which are still a food-source for human consumption ...

14.24 rattan and so forth.

14.27 A concept of collaborative management like this was what we intended.

14.34 A collaboration between the people and the government in the process of looking after the national park.

14.45 We are/were also going to facilitate an information campaign about the latest legislative developments.

14.50 For instance the laws of 1941 on forestry

15.00 in several parts of Indonesia. Recently there are several places where the laws have been changed, for example Tahura Poboya.

15.10 Previously Tahura was a protected area, now it has changed to become a limited production forest .

15.18 And why was this so -- it was because the Palu Citra Mineral company was going to mine for gold there.

15.24 (However) we believe that this “pengkaplingan” (i.e. subdivision and/or consolidation of deed of title to land) was only a mask

15.33 so that the land could be liberated from the people’s tenure so that when the company came in it was easy, they did not have to process the release of the land with the people but only with the government.

15.40 The government got so many percent -- and it was done!

15.44

And so, why has the economic crisis in Indonesia (not?) knocked us about.

15.52 Central Sulawesi did not feel it. in fact, we have been well off when we were affected by the economic crisis.

15.58 This is the opposite of what happened in other areas. Because other areas were dealing with mining, but we have agriculture.

16.06 So the economic crisis did not have a negative effect for us, but to the contrary, we benefited from it because our agriculture is always valued in dollars -- for chocolate. Thus the level of increase in the value of the dollar followed the price of chocolate or the price of chocolate followed the level of increases in the dollar.

16.25 That’s why many of the people of Central Sulawesi suddenly became rich.

16.30 Why was this not developed further? In fact it will have an influence on the future with changes in favour of mining. This is what is currently being advocated by friends in JATAM -- the mining network

16.44 both nationally and at the provincial level, who to advocate in favour of the victims of mining, as in Luwak and Mori --- the Exxon Tomori Sulawesi company

16.59 the biggest oil-exploitation firm in Indonesia for the next 25 years, owned by Arifin Panogoro -- the treasurer of the PDIP [Translator’s note: Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan -- the party led by Megawati Sukarnoputri]

17.08 How come Arifin Panogoro was able to go into this in an unimpeded way is because the PDIP is the party in power at the moment.

This is the connection between economic issues and political issues that we have been speaking of.

17.23 It is easy to see that when the members of our Representative Assembly are entrepreneurs, the regulations that they enact cannot possibly cause loss to their interests.

17.36 But we did not know -- because we kept quiet [...???.] then suddenly there is the company behind our houses.

17.43 So, our advocacy model in YTM is to provide information. And apart from that how did it happen that that Katu and Toro were known to the international world/on the international scene?

[...???.]

17.57 When this process came to fruition we publicized the events here on the international scene?

18.14 Toro in the future will become a field for research.

18.22 For this reason the village head of Toro started to build a “mess” (i.e. staff accommodation quarters). This was to become a source of income

(comment from the public 05)

18.32 And in Katu? According to the research [...???.] Is there uranium there?

18.43 Yes, but recently we had discussions with the Regent of Poso -- there is the possibility that [...???.] come to be a permanent village.

18.54 Because it appears that there is not going to be any felling of forest in Katu. In fact I came here with Ismet [...???.]

(comment from public 06)

19.16 I think it would be probably be best (if we were to) come here with the TNC, because we don't feel comfortable about it. All the more so because of the participation that has already occurred with the TNC concerning the management of natural resources

19.52 [...???.]

20.07 We also are often holding seminars on a large scale by bringing researchers and political and legal commentators here to be present in this/these participating/assisting village(s)

20.05 (inaudible comment)

20.30 [...???.] is one form of education which we undertake

20.32 And so there is usually a dialogue about policy/strategies such that there is a direct approach between the respected high-up people there -- the government and the Representative Assembly.

20.47 With the role of the researcher becoming clearer -- this is their role in society. So it is not correct that the government or our researchers are so freely providing (their) evaluations.

(unclear audio; not easily transcribable; meaning not clear)

20.59

(comment from public 06)

21.00 Is it that that is what you gentlemen from the YTM are trying to represent the villages

21.10 And that is certainly correct -- for that reason our wish is in fact that in all villages there is guidance

21.18

(comment from public 07)

21.18 Because YTM was successful especially in Katu Mr Demas once went to Jakarta and stayed in a hotel -- isn't that success in this struggle?

(comment from public 08)

On the issue of the national park:

21.40 I am thinking that with the issuing of regulations from the Ministry of the Interior and Forestry and that these are ministerial regulations [...???.].

21.57 Maybe in the next two to five years this could change. For example they could be enacted as legislation -- with the determination of these boundaries [...???.].

22.08 There could possibly be cooperation between Indonesia and the Netherlands because this used to be a Dutch colony.

22.16 Looking at the available potential [...???.] in view of the background of wealth as in Wanga -- in Watutau there is gold and maybe it is still in good supply.

22.38 (But) several decades into the future the gold could start to run out -- while we are waiting for the gold to run out. Please formalize the subdivision/consolidation of deed of title with the formulation of regulations -- such as a national park. We as citizens of this nation in the meantime need to look at how it is to be understood and accepted by the people so it is not a problem

23.11 [...???.]

23.19 This is what has not been communicated by the government and the agencies concerned.

In fact, internationally, in the demand for wood

23.36 there has been excess production such that now there are no HGU or HTI [Note: HGU=Hak Guna Usaha (rights of usufruct) and HTI=Hutan Tanaman Industri (Industrial Plantation Forest)] because it is seen to be unprofitable to process wood.

23.49 Now there is a scarcity of production in the minerals field, and so mining is going to be something that is strongly demanded/needed internationally.

24.07 An obstacle for international mining is in implementing the release of land belonging to the people -- they find difficulty in facing this -- overcoming it in Katu has begun, and this the matter of the national park.

24.25 There is an expression "looking after the forest" (forest conservation) and "looking after wood" (wood conservation) whereas in fact it is not exploited because there is overproduction at an international level. In order to overcome the economic crisis it is not possible for Indonesia to sell wood, because it does not sell/has no market internationally.

24.49 [...???.] Mining is going to become the main commodity. But this is something which we will discuss more systematically in our educational courses.

25.05 Maybe we will begin the discussion with why people wear shirts? Because according to the theory humans were born without being acquainted with religion --

25.33 but they were faced with the need to eat. It is the concept of looking for sustenance that brings about these issues -- the matter of the "belly" [...???.]

25.57 It also applies on a global level and on a national level -- the "belly" of the government. Why did America attack Iraq -- because the price of oil was under American control -- they could not compete with the price of Iraqi oil -- this also a matter of the "belly".

26.14

(comment from public 09)

So long as the belly is to the forefront people will always struggle

26.28 In the wake of that, religion is born -- why is there religion? In order to make it more simple -- how not to cause loss to others in the process of filling one's belly.

26.42 Why are there rich people -- because there are poor people

(comment from the public 10)

26.49 We need to be very grateful for the meeting this evening -- we have sifted through [or: possibly “menimbang” meaning “considered” is what is meant] a lot [...???.] I want to ask now how many local NGOs there are in Indonesia?

27.05 Many. There are hundreds of NGOs. There are two kinds of NGO -- there are NGOs that have been formed by the government in their efforts to implement government programs,

27.20 but there are also People’s Customary Organizations which are formed by the government in order to back-up the success of People’s Customary Organizations which have been formed by NGOs

27.35

(comment from the public 11)

It is a great pity, this situation. Whilst the national park is a national asset from an international point of view [...???.] Because by means of Indonesia’s national parks [...???.] There are 8 national parks in Indonesia [...???.] Because the national parks represent a magnet for national income.

28.02 So the struggle of the gentlemen in the NGO is quite heavy and we salute them [...???.] and are aware of the breakthrough. This is a fact that must be faced up to. It must!

So (for that reason) we could be branded as “provocateurs”

[laughter]

28.42 And we do not feel unhappy about that label. Because the people will speak of what they see, not of what they (have been given to) understand. Because the meaning of “demonstrating” [...???.] is to oppose a power. Whereas in fact, demonstrating is an effective tool to demand rights. If you think about it we were colonized by the Dutch and the Japanese [...???.] we gained independence not by sitting down but by means of demonstrating and demonstrating with arms.

29.18 Why was Indonesia colonized for such a long time? This is Gus Dur’s question. [Translator’s note: “Gus Dur” = Abdul Rahman Wahid, the fourth president of the Republic]

29.30

Dodolo A-E Track 2

(Village head of Kaduaa)

29.34 In the flood season, the season of “tanah gambut” [Translator’s note: “tanah gambut” literally means “peaty/mossy soil” and refers to a condition of land that is marginal for cultivation] came, why was there no protest here. Only in the year 2000 was there any activity. In fact I didn’t want to speak up. But what could I do ... I am impressed with several of those who have just offered their views [...???.] I was impressed by that matter.

30.03 This was in order that the NGO should work hard at it. [...???.] but also it should be appreciated ... Quite frankly I am disappointed with YTM. It is an NGO, isn’t it ... It is not an LSM outside the government. [Translator’s note: in the preceding few phrases the expressions “NGO” (Non-governmental organization) and “LSM” (Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat = People’s Self-help Organization) are used as if they mean different things, and indeed, translated literally they do; but in other contexts NGO and LSM are understood as translation equivalents. By contrasting them in this way the speaker may intend to highlight the different connotations of the two terms -- one implies local, small-scale organization and the other implies high-level, usually international organizations. In the rest of the transcription and audio-file LSM has been taken to be a translation equivalent for NGO because it is used to apply to both local and international entities.]

30.25 But we also should be appreciated ... from the beginning I have considered it to be a protest action, but why does it not value the people of Kaduaa?

30.37 That is the issue. What are we defending the national park for [...???.] It's up to [...???.] But the area that we defend [...???.] and I surrender this fully to the existing forum [...???.] I cannot make a decision.

30.56 And it is up to the office/council of the national park If it is indeed a national park office Please go ahead! ...And for the people of Kaduaa ... I myself and in fact ... The District Officer is my superior ... there are several gentlemen here ... please dismiss me as village head ... It is not a problem ... and if there is no mutual understanding between Kaduaa and Dodolo ... I do not take responsibility for the national park area coming into Kaduaa. I have in fact thought this through ...

31.39 what are the people of Dodolo like. Since the year 2000 we have come there, please don't do it! But it is wrong and in vain if you have already cleared... we want to return to that ... you haven't had any success from it, have you. But what I most strongly object to is the system set up by the people of Dodolo who don't mind being provoked. [Translator's note: the immediately preceding section is rather incoherent both in the audio-file and in the transcription -- however, overall, the meaning appears to be clear enough.]

32.00 That is what I do not agree to. Because you processed [Translator's note: presumably the Indonesian word "proses" here refers to some kind of administrative process] what you had in the year 2000 -- why not in 1994 and 1995. If we want to take it ... then please go ahead ... we also have an area which can be managed.

32.17 But don't put forward the matter of what was in process in 2000 That was people demonstrating energetically ... using that opportunity.

32.26 It is as if the people of Kaduaa have been treated despicably, quite frankly. Please, go ahead! The important thing is that I submit this fully to the forum.

32.42 There is the judgement /opinion of the District Officer on this matter ... if what I say is not properly expressed then I beg forgiveness from the people of Dodolo.

32.51 I regard the people of Dodolo as no different from myself. I am only the village head and my daily work is the same as you, sir, I also have to "korek pasir" (= "scrape up/through sand) hither and thither the same as you. That is the issue, but what I strongly object to is the system set up here.

33.17 Submit the (administrative) process after that Is that provocation by (outside) organizations? Yes, if you like, but please respect us. I said before that I am no different to the people of Dodolo ... I feel so sorry for them about the measures they have endured, but what can I do. Please, go ahead. But please respect us. Why must there have been people weeping like that.

33.55 Please continue ...

(comment from the public)

[... Unclear voice] The extent of the area is 4,500 m2 with 200 heads of family or more, whilst the extent of the area in Kaduaa is divided into four ... repeatedly we put this forward, so that the people of Dodolo could understand us the people of the village of Kaduaa.

34.40 The extent of the area of the village of Kaduaa with 200 heads of family or 1,045 persons is divided into four 1) the village of Dodolo 2) the main part of Kaduaa 3) the Toraja settlement 4) transmigrants. But up to this point we have still been able to hold on to the national park,

34.59 whilst there are more than 10 heads of family who do not have land. The government of the village of Kaduaa and public figures could direct our people to not interfere by clearing (forest) in the national park.

35.41 Because it is the people who own the national park. For example: when we clear in a river path, it is because the water for our agriculture is insufficient. We are deliberately putting this to you so that you may understand. Whether there should not be a national park is something we could debate without ever reaching a conclusion. We discuss this continually while our time is being wasted ... just think if we have four days of meetings that means that 48 hours of our working time is wasted.

36.06 What have we got from this meeting if we do not understand each other? This is our input from the people of Kaduaa so that Toe can understand our respective situations.

36.22 Don't let this matter cause loss of working time for us as farmers, because the people of Dodolo and Kaduaa are 99 percent farmers and not civil servants. So if we constantly lose working time what do we get out of it? I say this so that we may all understand. Thank you.

36.50 [There is a break in the recording here]

[Translator's note: From this point onwards the recording is extremely fuzzy, there is an echo from the public address system, and a lot of ambient noise -- it would be extremely difficult to transcribe in any detail because of significant gaps in audibility/intelligibility]

[Translator's note: The translation that follows from this point is based on the transcription provided only, which has been taken on trust as being at least a reasonably accurate account of what was said.]

Dodolo A-E Track 3

Having heard what is on the minds of the people of Kaduaa, we certainly need to accept the suggestions of the people of Kaduaa and Watutu. But we have to return (the matter) to the people because we cannot immediately come to a decision, all the more so (because) there has not been a deadlocked postponement today as in Wuasa. Today we are in agreement, but tomorrow there will again be people coming to interfere. Such that the problem of the subdivision/consolidation of deed of title (or, maybe: land registration) by Dodolo people, concerning the location "up there". We do not put anyone in the wrong --only the situation and the regulations. We are thinking into the future -- what we hope for in the case where there is no consensus or whether there is no consensus in the meeting -- whether the outcome is that there will or will not have been "reclamation", "drainage" and irrigation -- there is still an open opportunity. Hopefully we can enter into dialogue with the people, because there is no difference between us. We will be at one and on an equal footing. What we long for is that the Lore Lindu national park be preserved and for the welfare of the people. The measure of welfare that we will give evidence of is whether people eat twice a day or not. But the inner (spiritual) measure of welfare is hard to measure. However loudly we speak we must not arouse a sense of difference, but must strengthen the sense of kinship amongst us all.

So if we from the government, whether it is the District level government or village level government have offended your feelings -- it does not mean that you are the enemies of the government. Because what is the meaning of government if not the people and what is the meaning of (government) programs if they are not supported by both government and the people. We represent an umbrella organization for consultation regarding the needs of the people. Both NGOs and any other organization whatever represent a part of the life of government and the people. Our mistakes are our joint/collective mistakes -- as I was saying previously [...???.] but the system and the situation are changing/have changed. I am in agreement with whatever was said by the village head of Kaduaa -- why is there not friendship? It is not the people of Dodolo who are wrong, it is only that the situation has changed -- (it is) the organization of the people of the nation and the nation state that has changed. So what was said previously is very true -- we asked if we were to cultivate "down there" [Translator's note: indicating a place in a direction relevant to some point of reference.] -- and why not? What we desire is that we should be able to continue to scratch a living ... that we still give (them) a chance in that place. So I believe that what was presented was the true sentiment of the people of Kaduaa -- to give the people Dodolo an opportunity. However, that it should not be added to. We talked repeatedly in the church, concerning forest/woodlands clearing and we submitted that it should be prohibited. So I believe that the people of Dodolo can understand --- and that the "lower area" can be used for chocolate/cacao production. It is not necessary to cultivate 2 ha -- just plant 200 trees -- that would be enough. I have asked some people: How many hectares do you have. The answer was 2 ha, and they asked in return, how many hectares does the District Officer own. (Or, it was said: I have land that measures 60 x [...???.] just that, not even 1 hectare. I also asked what do you grow? They answered that it is not yet planted. If I owned it would already have been producing chocolate. For what purpose do you own as much as 2 ha and not cultivate it? When I looked into it, it turns out that that the land is in Kaduaa, Dodolo and Wangga. Perhaps it could be asked who is it who cultivates the "green" (I.e. conserved) areas that we agreed upon previously/yesterday/the other day. There is an offer/proposal to plant leda (=1 k.o. large timber tree. 2. k.o. Artocarpus tree that produces small, delicious fruit.) eucalyptus, agatis (a kind of timber), and candle-nut. So to all you gentlemen present here I am communicating today's decision and am asking for your agreement, because we are/have an umbrella organization. The village headman, the LKMD and BP are signing. Tomorrow we will present it to the Regent (of the sub-Province) for

his knowledge/information of the matter. We are thinking about what you all need to eat today (your daily needs). As I said previously, do not give people fish but only the fishhook. Please exploit only what is already there -- that which has been agreed upon today --- for our joint benefit. Once again we beg your pardon -- it does not mean that the people of Dodolo are in the wrong. I say this from my heart. And if it turns out later that there has not yet been a mutual understanding then it can be resolved. Ladies and Gentlemen we express our thanks to the people of Dodolo who have prepared food and drink for us.

We have already agreed: Firstly, that the people of Dodolo cease clearing the forest in the national park and/or only clear what they already have. Secondly, that the people of Dodolo need not plant chocolate/cacao. Thirdly, the request of the people of Dodolo for drainage and irrigation. For the program of drainage and irrigation we will propose it to the village council of CSIADP. Fourthly, we must support the decision of the people of Kaduaa, and give them one year and if it is not finalized (in that time) to grant an extension in the matter of planting, and as quickly as possibly we (will) plant out because we/they already have the seedlings. Fifthly, that the occasion of this meeting should not be the cause of enmity. Our kinship must be guarded, and we must be alert to the possibility that there are people who want to disrupt our unity and kinship which all this time has grown and developed well in the area of North Lore. And Sixthly: to value and respect each other. Now we want to resolve/determine the village boundaries

Dodolo A-E Track 04

What we have just finalized is the boundary between Wuasa and Watumaeta. Watumaeta asked for the boundary to go as far as Sandy (the food-stall) and Wuasa asked for it go as far as the main entrance gate. In the end it was agreed that Watumaeta [...???.] the former hunting area of the people of Wuasa. So it was determined that the boundary should be the main entrance gate (with archway?).

Even though the population increases, the area of land does not increase. As was submitted to the National Park, i.e. that in Palu there a tendency for the water to run out, (and so for that reason) we must not allow water shortages to occur. So, gentlemen, the points we presented just now, we believe we can accept. And there is no intention on the part of the government or from NGOs to intervene or to create divisions, but rather only to strengthen kinship amongst ourselves. Life must go on and nothing is that easy. This is what I want to communicate in order to create peace/security in our region. I will develop Lore (cooperatively) between the government and the people. The government has the ability to facilitate whatever is needed by the people, both at the village level as well as at the District level. Thank you. What we have proposed is our collective wish.

Summary of what was presented by the Discussion Leader:

First: The people of Dodolo are prepared to cease all activities

Second: The people of Dodolo will not plant chocolate/cacao

Third: The request of the people of Dodolo for drainage and irrigation works

Fourth: To support the results of the decision of Kaduaa village for one year for planting seasonal crops, and if the process of drainage and irrigation is realized to still be given the opportunity to do so

Fifth: That today's meeting not create enmity

Dodolo B-F Track 5

In the year 1992 there was a plan for subdivision/consolidation of deed of title for national park, and it was decided in 1998 in a conference in Bali. We observed the unilateral determination of the national park -- certainly there was involvement of the people but it was only the village head, not the populace. We saw this has a potential for conflict, in the sense that we saw that the national park would be the subdivision/consolidation of deed of title of land which was previously held by the people under customary tenure. It included the CSIADPC project which at first was the construction of a road. In essence the construction of the road was in order to put a boundary around the national park, however what we can observe is that the project was never finalized, the road is already in disrepair. Why make the road? As a means to stimulate the people, in order that they want one side of the road to be a national park. An example is the Toro case: first of all in Toro it was put to them [...???.] it was up to the people, where the boundary of the national park was then that was where the road should be. And indeed the population at that time needed a road very much. In fact the people of Dodolo and the people of Katu wanted to go down and move not because they wanted to leave their land, but because they had lived for too

long without an asphalt road. Because they wanted to live on an asphalt road so that their access to communications would be easier. We do not speak of the issue of the road only, but we see that it had the potential for conflict, in particular a conflict over natural resources. This is what became clear in the case of the national park looked after by the forestry police. What was the consequence of this? There was theft of timber. This was what we supported, in the hope/expectation that how might there not be theft of wood? But the people continued to have access and could take wood or rattan without it being called theft. Previously when someone took rattan it was said to be theft, this is what we supported enthusiastically: to release the land so that it returned to be under customary tenure according to principles such as those proposed by the government for the custodianship of the forest. Thus there was a case/conflict such as that in Toro. Previously, in Toro, before the customary tenure area was put on the map and returned to their tenure there were thefts of rattan because indeed the people (there) had lived from the collection of rattan, and hunting wildlife that are protected such as dwarf-buffalo and deer-pig. But after returning to their ownership, village regulations were enacted concerning how to protect the area in question, so that it did not deviate from the principle of a national park. But as a national park, it was simultaneously owned by the people. So village regulations were determined which did not allow the people to hunt dwarf-buffalo (under pain of) a customary penalty. That is why now dwarf buffalo have begun to go into the people's orchards. Before they were almost extinct. From that point Mr Banjar became interested and friends with the YTM, because there was a new conflict

TRANSCRIPTION OF DODOLO A-E AND DODOLO B-F

Dodolo A-E Track 5 = Dodolo B-F Track 4

0.00 YTM, YTM

0.06 Today we wish to apologize, because of the delay of two hours, the problem has been that

0.18 Mr Hamdin from YTM arrived only half an hour ago. I thought he was not going to come when suddenly he was here getting out of the car .

0.38 Gentlemen, our talk this afternoon is going to be : my/our discussions with YTM which will be presented by Mr Hamdin -- YTM will work together with the people of Kaduaa, or will ask for the preparedness of the people of Kaduaa to work together with the YTM in the efforts to finalize the conflict over natural resources and the strengthening of the rights of the customary-law community and farmers in the area of Kaduaa village which was spoken of four days ago.

1.31 We have come to the conclusion that we cannot provide a clear decision concerning the NGO [...???....] in undertaking guidance [...???....] and why not? (They can be) accepted under one model of cooperation.

1.59 Nevertheless, in order to discuss it properly we have provided a timetable as to when we can meet.

2.15 And here we invite BPD (Badan Perwakilan Desa), LA (Lembaga Adat), government representatives and women leaders who are not present. For discussion and (in the matter of) making a decision and cooperating with the YTM [...???....] not just a unilateral/one-sided decision or just on behalf of the government without the people.

2.46 In the afternoon the essence of our discussion will be communicated by Mr Hamdin -- there will be no discussion leader -- we now hand you over to Mr Hamdin:

(Hamdin -- YTM)

3.18 Thank you for this opportunity. Before we enter into discussions, I would like to introduce you to the matter of YTM.

3.40 We were established in 1992. Our initial activity was in Katu village and right up until now is still to cultivate a (communicative) connection.

3.56 Our work in the YTM is to undertake advocacy or defence for the customary-law and farming community.

4.15 What we mean by defence/guidance is in the form of guidance about people's rights. (About) what are in

fact the people's rights.

4.29 Before we undertake this guidance/defence/support, when there is a problem we work cooperatively with the community in the form of training.

4.41 For example legal training which we usually refer to as "para-legal training". In this training we give explanations or train the people to understand the law.

5.00 Whatever laws are published by the nation that take the side of the people and laws which neglect the rights of the people.

5.14 This is rather difficult for the people to understand in recent times because there has been no mass "socialization" (i.e. publicity/promotion) of the law by the regional government which (might have) reached into the villages.

5.26 For example there is (a/the) regional regulation(s) -- hardly any of the public know about the development of law, whether it is enacted by Level I, Level II or at the Central Level [Translator's note: corresponding to sub-province, provincial and national levels respectively].

5.38 We have tried to facilitate knowledge of this by the people. For instance, the latest laws published about general elections, this has gone into a second stage [...???..].

5.57 We do not feel sure about whether the laws concerning general elections have been understood by the people in a thoroughgoing way. And yet the people are invited to participate in the elections.

6.11 The nation involves the people in political events every five years at a time when the people do not understand political issues.

6.22 As a consequence the model of elections not being understood is a loss for the people themselves, or they elect people they do not know (about).

6.34 This is a problem in our society.

6.40 This a problem that originates in a government which does indeed do [...???..] for the people.

6.55 The strengthening that is referred to applies in the area of law and democracy and the rights of people and farmers -- what are their rights, and then what rights don't they have.

7.12 All along what is referred to as claiming (rights) for the people is (to tell them) how to fulfil their duties and the government never explains what their rights are.

7.24 For example, with regard to education, the people have a right to get an appropriate education, but at a time when the people's economic life is weak the cost of education is high -- so they can't afford it. It should be that at a time when they are economically weak then education should be cheap.

7.44 This is what was offered by the PDIP in its campaign -- that if it won then education would be free.

7.51 But when Megawati [Translator's note: the leader of the PDIP and the fifth president of the republic] got into power they withdrew education subsidies.

7.56 They did one thing during their campaign but their attitude was different when they got into power.

8.01 The question is what should be our attitude to this? Training will go in the direction of these matters.

8.10 And then just the 68 villages in the environs of the national park are on average villages which have a potential for conflict of their own, particularly with regard to natural resources.

8.27 For example in Kaduaa -- maybe the national park will become a (cause for) conflict in the future,

8.32 but also there may be other matters that become (a cause for) conflict, for example the operation of the firm

PT Hasfarm. According to the latest information from the village head [...???.] is not used by PT Hasfarm but is allowed lay idle.

8.47 So land is left idle at a time when there are several groups in the village which do not have land.

8.51 [...???.] whether the land is sold or not.

8.55 Usually they turn it back on the people in the following way: you had land once, so why did you not use it, and why did you sell it?

9.07 But in fact this should be understood as a whole/in a thorough manner. How it came about that the people sold (their) land.

9.16 Their answer is: firstly the people cannot exploit it because they have no capital,

9.23 and secondly they were forced for rather urgent financial reasons to sell -- this is something that has not attracted serious attention.

9.34 And so, some time ago I was talking with the TNC, because of their "intense"(involvement) here.

9.41 I met with Ismet, and [...???.] we leave aside the events of the past, however, for example our friends from the YTM were always saying that the activities of TNC were wrong,

9.55 and TNC saying, to the contrary, that the activities of the YTM were wrong.

10.00 Now (the issue is) how can we go hand in hand and work together.

10.05 If for example the TNC supports the people and stimulates the people's economic (life) then we of the YTM will support the people in the strengthening of their rights by means of alternative education.

10.31 For example: law, organization, how to claim rights, and what in fact their duties are, and the essence of what their rights and duties are.

10.54 Since 1992 we have supported several villages around the national park,

11.00 such as: Katu, Doda, Toe (Dodolo), Wanga,

11.07 Winowanga (not so intensive involvement) because we did not have enough personnel ... or the personnel were not prepared ... there was only Ferdinand here at that time.

11.29 Mataue, Toro, Gimpu, Pilimakujawa, and Moa.

11.39 If the people of Kaduaa were agreed to a cooperative relationship this means that Kaduaa also was one (of them)

11.55 but this was just an initial discussion, in the future it will/would be more comprehensive when we have begun.

12.00 Because our method was to begin with village workshops.

12.06 whose goal is to find out about all the problems first and after that to discuss the sources of problems which later still would be publicized in the form of a program. In the form of a collective program.

12.34 This is without specifying the form of the program, but in essence it was to accompany/support the resolution of conflicts (about) sources of natural resources and the strengthening the rights of customary law and farmer communities.

12.51 I think that is enough from me, later we will develop (these points) in a question and answer (session).

(comment from public - 00)

13.30 What was the motivation for the name Tanah Merdeka (Free/Independent Lands)? What is the background (needed) in order to engage in cooperation? What programs are offered in this cooperation? And, of course [...] in that cooperation there should be no party (to it) that loses out?

[The final 1 minute and 40 seconds, from 13.30 onwards, has not been fully transcribed -- possibly because it is not altogether clear and coherent.]

15.10 [END OF AUDIO FILE]

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BPD	: Badan Perwakilan Desa (Village Representative Body)
CSIADCP	: Central Sulawesi Integrated Area Development Conservation Program
DPR/D	: Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat/Daerah (Regional/People's Representative Assembly)
Ha.	: Hektar (hectare)
HGU	: Hak Guna Usaha (rights of usufruct)
HTI	: Hutan Tanaman Industri (Industrial Plantation Forest)
JATAM	: Jaringan Advokasi Tambang (Mining Advocacy Network)
LA	: Lembaga Adat (Customary/customary law Organization)
LKMD	: Lembaga Ketahanan Masyarakat Desa (Village People's Defence Organization)
LSM	: Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat (People's Self-help Organization, I.e. the standard translation equivalent for NGO)
KK	: Kepala Keluarga (Head of Family)
KKM	: Kesepakatan Konservasi Masyarakat (People's Conservation Agreement/Consensus)
KPKPST	: (LSM di Palu yang Fokus Isu Perempuan) (an NGO in Palu which focuses on Women's Issues)
PDIP	: Partai Demokrasi Indonesia Perjuangan (The Indonesian Democracy Party "Perjuangan" [i.e. "Struggle" or offshoot/splinter party])
Perda	: Peraturan Daerah (Regional Regulations -- I.e. at Provincial or Municipality level)
Polhut	: Polisi kehutanan (Forestry police)
SD	: Sekolah Dasar (Primary School)
Tahura	: Taman Hutan Raya (Primary Forest Park)
Trans	: Transmigrasi (Transmigration)
TNC	: The Nature Conservancy
UU/D	: Undang-Undang/Dasar (UU = Laws/Legislation; UU Dasar = Fundamental, i.e. constitutional, law)
YTM	: Yayasan Tanah Merdeka. (The Free, or Independent, Lands Foundation)

This document was created with Win2PDF available at <http://www.win2pdf.com>.
The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only.
This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.